

**MEMO: Capitol Collaborative on Race & Equity  
June 2020**

**To:** Government Operations Agency, CalHR

**Submitted By:** Julia Caplan, Program Director, Public Health Institute - Health in All Policies ([julia.caplan@sgc.ca.gov](mailto:julia.caplan@sgc.ca.gov))

**Re:** Recommendations to California Leads as an Employer Task Forces from the Capitol Collaborative on Race and Equity

---

## Background

In February 2020, Eraina Ortega, CalHR Director, requested that participating agencies in the Capitol Collaborative on Race & Equity (CCORE)<sup>1</sup> provide recommendations on workforce equity to the California Leads as an Employer Task Forces.

In March 2020, Director Ortega met with CCORE team coordinators and executive sponsors to provide background on the nature of the Task Forces and request recommendations. Between March and April, CCORE staff collected recommendations from state entities and compiled their submissions.

CCORE participants include:

- Air Resources Board
- Arts Council
- CalEPA
- Caltrans
- Coastal Commission
- Corrections and Rehabilitation
- Education
- Housing and Community Development
- Public Health
- Social Services
- State Lands Commission
- Strategic Growth Council

Below are over 160 recommendations. Some come directly from CCORE participant Racial Equity Action Plans, some have arisen through the CCORE implementation and learning process, and others were identified as best or promising practices

---

<sup>1</sup> The Capitol Collaborative on Race and Equity (CCORE) is a community of California State government entities working together to embed racial equity approaches into institutional culture, policies, and practices. Since 2018, CCORE departments have created Racial Equity Action Plans that include recommended programmatic and policy changes for their own departments. They have also identified enterprise-wide changes that could aid their intended work and outcomes. They have put considerable thought and time into racial equity as a movement and their Racial Equity Action Plans. More information on CCORE can be found here: <https://sgc.ca.gov/programs/hiap/racial-equity/>.

from leaders in the field (i.e., Race Forward and the Government Alliance on Race and Equity). CCORE participants were invited to include additional notes to accompany their recommendations where appropriate.

The recommendations below are organized by relevance to particular Task Forces, and are presented in no particular order or ranking. While staff provided a few small edits for clarity, recommendations are largely presented in the original wording as submitted by participating agencies.

The recommendations are organized in the following categories:

- I. Recommendations that did not indicate a specific Task Force, grouped by category
- II. Recommendations for Diversity & Inclusion Task Force
- III. Recommendations for Racial & Gender Pay Equity Task Force
- IV. Recommendations for Sexual Harassment and Discrimination Prevention and Response Task Force
- V. Recommendations for Public Safety Diversity Task Force
- VI. Recommendations from 2018 HiAP Task Force Workforce Equity Report

---

## Recommendations

### I. Recommendations that did not indicate a specific Task Force, grouped by category

Enterprise-Wide Personnel Policies and Practices
1) Establish a state-wide Office of Equity to coordinate racial and other equity work across the departments and agencies in California state government, as a centralized office.
2) Create a Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion office within CalHR with adequate staffing and resources to support departments/agencies on this topic. This office should include develop guidance and support for Diversity Committees in Departments. Guidance on "diversity" should be comprehensive and include race/ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, and other identities and communities.
3) CalHr and unions work together to establish recommendations for an equitable approach to pay reductions and furloughs in times of severe budget cuts, emergency response, etc.
4) Evaluate the minimum qualifications of classifications (at multiple levels) with the largest workforce disparities. Conduct an enterprise wide analysis of job requirements to ensure educational requirements are appropriate the job, and for some classifications, allowing experience to substitute for formal education. Provide guidance

for Departments to conduct best practices for minimum qualifications (ex: <a href="https://www.racialequityalliance.org/2015/06/08/minimum-qualifications/">https://www.racialequityalliance.org/2015/06/08/minimum-qualifications/</a> ).
5) Identify classifications that mandate/require criminal background checks, and perform an analysis on whether these are appropriate/necessary under current law and regulations. CalHR to develop guidance on best practices (example: <a href="https://www.nelp.org/wp-content/uploads/Fair-Chance-Ban-the-Box-Best-Practices-Models.pdf">https://www.nelp.org/wp-content/uploads/Fair-Chance-Ban-the-Box-Best-Practices-Models.pdf</a> ).
6) Provide guidance/permit the following: if/when a position/program serves a specific target population (racial/ethnic; gender; etc.) the duty statements should include and interview questions should allow for applicants to speak to their professional AND lived experience with the relevant population.
7) Contractor: Assess the magnitude of inequality when including independent contractors. Currently, as far as we are aware, the state does not track the race, gender, or pay of contractors.
8) Policy: Stop using the CA Labor Workforce as a comparison group for analyzing the underutilized classifications. We know that there are significant inequities in the larger workforce, CA State Government should strive to set an example of equity and parity.
9) Develop State of California Equitable Hiring Guidelines (see Colorado's Hiring Guide as an example: <a href="https://sites.google.com/state.co.us/colorado-equity-alliance/home/tools-resources">https://sites.google.com/state.co.us/colorado-equity-alliance/home/tools-resources</a> and also see Race Forward's Government Alliance on Race and Equity, Opportunities for Advancing Racial Equity in Public Sector Jobs: <a href="https://www.racialequityalliance.org/resources/public-sector-jobs-opportunity-for-advancing-racial-equity/">https://www.racialequityalliance.org/resources/public-sector-jobs-opportunity-for-advancing-racial-equity/</a> ).
10) In depth mandatory training for managers and supervisors on the topics of: Equity, implicit bias, structural racism, the history of racism and government, identifying microaggressions, belonging and othering, communicating about race.
11) An executive order from the Governor's Office on Equity, defining it, acknowledging disparities created and exacerbated by government (like the Executive Order N-15-19 establishing the Truth and Healing Council).
12) Mandate each state department to identify disparities by race relative to their services and roles, and a plan to address the disparities.
13) The creation of a statewide team, consisting of representatives from each state department, devoted to addressing intersectional issues and solutions (like the Health in All Policies Task Force).
14) Mandate each department to create public dashboards to track progress of DE&I efforts over time and increase transparency and accountability. The dashboards can include things like disaggregated workforce information and pay information.
15) Disaggregate statewide workforce data, looking at representation of race (gender) at all levels of staff.

16) Collect race data at exam phase to close the data gap between who is taking exams and who is passing/applying and subsequently who is being hired.
17) Data needs to be looked at per department and as CA as a whole, diversity numbers and deficiencies should not be carried heavily by a limited number of departments.
18) Allocate the resources for CalHR to redact the names, addresses, schools, and other identifying information off of exam and hiring applications. Build this into their systems so it does not have to be done with each department and each job posting.
19) Require departments to produce annual reports and updates about their efforts and current workforce demographics.
20) More robust upward mobility investment and structure, mentor programs, training and development opportunities offered for high paying job classifications in each department.
<b>Workforce data</b>
21) Data Approach should answer these questions 1) Are there some classifications where employees do not represent the community in the community at large? 2) Are people of color clustered in lower-wage classifications? 3) Are there wage differentials by race/ethnicity and gender?
22) Each State Department analyze available data on retention and promotion by race/ethnicity to explore any potential disparities retention and promotion by race/ethnicity. Publish this in an annual report and make available to Department programs.
23) Based off the annual report, examine which classifications and/or programs have the largest disparities. HR and personnel offices focus targeted efforts to work with programs with the largest disparities.
24) Develop guidance for Department HR and Personnel offices to create and maintain dashboard that assist with tracking of progress in workforce disparities. Incentivize/reward/recognize Departments who are utilizing these tracking methods.
25) Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Update State employee demographic questionnaire (Form 1070) to include more race and gender options. CDPH has recommendations about SOGI questions based on recent legislation: <a href="https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CFH/DWICSN/CDPH%20Document%20Library/LocalAgencies/eWPPM/510-60SexualOrientationandGenderIdentity(SOGI).pdf">https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CFH/DWICSN/CDPH%20Document%20Library/LocalAgencies/eWPPM/510-60SexualOrientationandGenderIdentity(SOGI).pdf</a> .
26) Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Form 1070: Allow employees to select multiple racial/ethnic categories
27) Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Form 1070: Incorporate additional racial/ethnic categories including disaggregating Hispanic or Latino and Black or African American groups and including a "Middle East/North Africa" descent category.

28)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Form 1070: Collect gender identity in addition to or instead of sex.
29)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Track and document self-reported data from Form 1070 (i.e., how many people complete their own form versus having someone else fill it out).
30)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Report 5102: Identify and include the percent or number of self-reported records by race/ethnicity and sex in Report 5102.
31)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Enhance accessibility of publicly available data (e.g., making tables from Report 5102 machine readable, providing additional public documents (such as classification and pay scale ranges) in excel).
32)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Include gender and race pay analysis as part of Report 5102 so that the state is regularly analyzing and reporting on pay parity.
33)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: In analysis of gender and race pay include analysis by supervisor/manager and rank and file.
34)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Analyze pay differences within classifications, controlling for service months.
35)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Assess whether there is disproportionality in Merit Salary Adjustments (MSAs).
36)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Evaluate civil service application, exam, and hiring data (requires collecting demographic data at all points of the hiring process).
37)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: Conduct longitudinal analysis by tracking job classifications over time: The State could also look at the mobility of underrepresented groups over time to establish whether they are moving up the career ladder and receiving promotions within civil service at the same rate as other employee groups. This may require an analysis education/experience.
38)Employee data collection, analysis, and reporting: all efforts should also consider including other available state data for historically marginalized communities such as disability status (which is collected on STD 678).
<b>Supervisors/Managers</b>
39)Expand the mandatory 80 hour supervisor training to include robust Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion curriculum. This curriculum should be evidence-based and remain flexible to suit the needs of each Department. The curriculum should also expand beyond implicit bias to include microaggressions. Implicit bias trainings should include applied best practices toward regular supervisor duties (hiring, interviewing, promoting).
40)Supervisor and managers to be evaluated on Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Metrics as part of annual performance appraisals. Metrics may include employee sentiment, sense of belonging, workplace satisfaction,

engagement, retention, coaching, and promotion rates. Provide guidance and resources for supervisors such as coaching and employee engagement surveys for supervisors to gather input on strengths and weaknesses.
<b>Employee Resources</b>
41) Increase/provide childcare subsidies/vouchers.
42) Increase parental leave, both paid time off and unpaid time off, in compliance with bargaining contracts.
43) Increase awareness and access to Employee Assistance Programs. One approach would be to encourage supervisors and managers to share information about EAPs directly with employees to help reduce any potential stigma associated.
44) Provide/increase education or tuition assistance programs for Departments. Provide guidance/encourage Departments to create, or advertise, these programs. Programs should be targeted toward classifications with widest disparities and prioritized for entry level and mid-level staff.
45) Provide an incentive (stipend or professional development resources) for staff of color to create and maintain Employee Resource Groups (ERGs or affinity groups). Guidance on these ERG's should be provided and include the requirement for a senior executive sponsor at each department to support these groups. Guidance should also include making available a budget to support employee resource groups, coaches, facilitators and also to allow employee duty statements to include time to spend on employee resource groups. Allocating resources for ERGs should consider how ERGs are including other historically marginalized groups such as the LGBTQ+ staff, differently abled staff, and others, from an intersectional standpoint.
46) Develop coaching and best practices for Departments to provide to various leaders and levels of the organization. Coaching and best practices should be specific for, at a minimum, executive management (i.e. establishing a vision/goals), HR professionals (i.e. creating safe spaces and communications loops), supervisors/managers (i.e. model inclusive behavior).
47) Upward mobility: Evaluate what components of the Upward Mobility program have worked best in closing the gender pay gap in recent years. For instance: Which departments have the most robust Upward Mobility programs? What makes certain initiatives more successful than others? Are programs being adequately funded? What lessons from this work can be applied to racial equity?
48) Training: Build off of current CalHR training curriculum, such as State-mandated curriculum on unconscious bias, by incorporating other equity-oriented lessons. These can include training on how to apply a racial equity lens to policies and programs for managers and supervisors.
49) Training: Increase resources for CalHR's Office of Civil Rights and Workforce Development Program in order to enhance racial equity components of data tracking and analysis, managerial training, and workforce development and planning.

50) Training: In the Supervisor/Manager training, include a systems level lens to unconscious bias (currently only focuses on individual bias) and broaden frame to include a larger equity lens.
51) Explore employee recognition program with an equity focus.
52) Enhance or develop internship programs in classifications and program with the largest disparities. HR and Personnel Offices to develop a regularly updated contact list for professional associations, including undergraduate and graduate school associations.
53) Provide Departments the resources and tools to explore, develop, and adopt a voluntary job rotation/cross training program as a strategy to build skills for all staff, including staff demographics that are underrepresented in Department Leadership.
<b>Hiring, Promotion, and Retention</b>
54) Job announcements: Include a statement of commitment to equity and inclusion into the posting (e.g., "We believe that all people - no matter their race, ethnicity, gender identity, sexual orientation, income, education level, age, language, religion, ability, or geographic location, national origin - should have the opportunity to live healthy lives [or relevant Department mission]."
55) Job announcements: Use plain language: Review writing resources (Plain Language Thesaurus, Federal Plain Language Guidelines). Avoid jargon, acronyms, and overly complex information. In many ways, the way a position is posted, or advertised, is more critical to inclusion than the position description. The posting is a great way to sell the position, and state the importance and value that diversity and inclusion play in the important work you do.
56) Job announcements: Develop supplemental questions that acknowledge the value of an applicant's lived experience, and/or that emphasize the ability to work successfully in an environment serving a diverse community and in a diverse workplace. Be thoughtful about the number of supplemental questions; too many questions, in addition to a cover letter, resume, and application can be very taxing on the candidate.
57) Job announcements: Determine the criteria you want used to evaluate applicants based on the required and desired qualifications specified in the job announcement. Select criteria that are: measurable, job-related, align with business needs, and include an applicant's ability to successfully serve a diverse community.
58) Recruitment: CalHR and/or Department HR offices should expand guidance, and Department HR offices should expand efforts for outreach strategies to non-traditional outlets (communities and schools from under-represented minorities) and offer resources (including staffing) for people who are interested in applying to help guide them through the state application process.
59) General: Integrate racial equity into job descriptions. This includes using interview questions to help assess a candidate's understanding of the opportunities to advance racial equity. Example of questions are: 1) How do you see yourself contributing to our work on advancing racial equity? (listen for candidate's past experiences will

add or enhance Department/programs efforts); 2) Describe a situation in which you worked on a project with people who were from backgrounds other than your own. What was challenging for you in this work? What did you do to make your work together successful? (listen to see if the candidate has reflected on the opportunities and challenges of creating inclusive workplace cultures); 3) Provide examples of ways in which you worked to eliminate institutional racism in previous jobs (listen to see if the candidate has a clear understanding of institutionalized racism and has relevant experience combating institutionalized racism).
60) Interview: Arrange for implicit bias training for interview panel members.
61) Interview: Utilize approved interview questions that address diversity, inclusion, and cultural competency objectives (e.g., What efforts have you contributed toward advancing equity and inclusion in your work experiences? What have you done, personally or professionally, to learn about and then address equity and inclusion?
62) Interview: Suggest candidates arrive early for the interview and provide a list of possible interview questions or topics so they have a few minutes to process. Offering a list of questions may assist those candidates that may not be as accustomed to interviewing, or whose cognitive style requires more time for reflection. Some positions may require assessing "off-the-cuff" thinking and may not be suited to offering interview questions in advance.
63) Retention: Reframe Retention to be broadly about culture and belonging. Diversity + Inclusion + Belonging = Retentions.
64) Retention: Establish target goals, reporting, and accountability. For example, if your agency has a survey around diversity and inclusion, set a goal to have a 3% increase in employees answering positively to questions around collaborative and inclusive workspaces, fair and equitable advancement opportunities, and feeling recognized, safe, and respected in the workplace.
65) Retention: Adopt and implement a California version of "Colorado's Creating A Culture of Belonging: A Guide for Retaining Staff" ( <a href="https://sites.google.com/state.co.us/colorado-equity-alliance/home/tools-resources">https://sites.google.com/state.co.us/colorado-equity-alliance/home/tools-resources</a> ).
66) Promotions: Analyze what positions can promote in place and which cannot. Determine if and what are potential unintended consequences of differences in being able to promote in place (for example, in CDPH we know that in general, lower level positions tend to be held by more diverse staff, whereas higher level classification tend to be whiter, how relatively "easy" or "hard" is it for lower level positions to continue to climb the classification ladder compared to other higher level positions).
67) Promotions: Collect and analyze demographic data on promotions.
68) Exit surveys: Should be (1) made anonymous to the extent possible, (2) requested from EVERYONE who leaves the Department, and (3) collected on a standardized form (e.g., a Survey Monkey that's uniform across the Department, not variable from Division to Division or Branch to Branch). Examples of creating anonymity: aggregating all survey responses for a large program for a 3-6 month period before sharing that information with



managers and supervisors/outside of Human resources offices (Similar aggregation could be done with smaller programs/offices compiled together for a multi-month period before sharing out).
69) Exit Interview: Conduct exit interviews/surveys and analyze results when staff leave a department (even to go to another State Civil Servant positions) to understand drivers of exit. Include the collection of racial, gender, and sexual orientation data (measures need to be included to ensure that anonymity of survey respondents) to see if there are differences by demographics.

## II. Recommendations for Diversity & Inclusion Task Force

Recommendations:	Notes:
70) The Governor's Office should provide clear direction to all agencies to improve racial, gender, sexual orientation, etc. equity and increase gender, racial, ethnic, etc. diversity within organizations. Direction and budget resources for all agencies to implement best practices and guidance to achieve gender, racial, ethnic, etc. equity. Direction and budget resources to increase outreach and inclusion of different races, genders, ethnicities, sexual orientations, etc. in outreach and rulemakings, and to seek regular public input on, and do regular review of, effectiveness and impact of programs across different races, genders, ethnicities, sexual orientations, etc.	Need to ensure support for changing systems that perpetuate inequities within agencies and in their work with the public. Public input by all groups into State policies reduces the likelihood of discriminatory effects and creates public faith and trust in government and law, making it more effective and reducing violations.
71) CalHR/SPB should develop and implement best practices across all state agencies for recruitment, hiring, promotional, and retention strategies to achieve diversity that reflects all of California.	Needed to ensure all state agencies, and not only some, are striving for improved diversity.
72) GO/CalHR should create guidance (or requirement) for all State agencies around special emphasis groups or employee resource groups.	Would help for generalized direction so that agencies can learn how to appropriately include resource groups in their organizations.
73) EEO: CalHR and the CA Civil Rights Officers' Council initiated a roundtable discussion for the Diversity and Inclusion group to uniformly roll out future policies, guidelines, training. Expand the Group to include all department and use the platform to further expand and implement policies.	D&I effort depends on the support and initiative of the agency and there is no uniform policy, guidelines, or training to implement change management.

<p>74)EEO: The Competitive Rating Report process needs to change in CARB where there is a full review of the panel composition, questions, justification of hire, and sign off from all relevant parties before a conditional offer is made. The EEO Office is not receiving the CRRs on time and offers are being made without the proper signature of the EEO Officer in which some hires were questionable. The checks and balances in place are not being utilized, implemented, or respected.</p>	<p>Diversity &amp; Inclusion of the workplace starts with outreach and the hiring process. The CRR process is not being utilized, implemented, and respected. Programs are hiring without the proper signature or process that includes EEO Officer's review of the hiring process, panel composition, questions asked, justification of hire, etc. before a conditional offer is made. CRR's are not submitted to the EEO Office in a timely manner and is often treated as an afterthought and not part of the process.</p>
<p>75)EEO: Language Access - there is a process and a coordinator in place that needs to be respected and utilized. Programs tries to implement their own process, ignoring the necessary timeline needed to complete the task, providing incorrect or insufficient information to properly procure translators. In addition, cooperation and response is needed when the language survey is launched to properly assess the number of the employees who speak another language, services provided to the public in another language, and account for the employees who received bilingual pay.</p>	<p>To provide a uniformed service for the programs and the public. All managers and supervisors in charge of board agendas, public outreach, or public workshop including division liaisons need the proper training on the Language Access process and coordinate with the EEO Office in a timely manner.</p>
<p>76)The current state taskforce for gender equity creates rules only for the private sector, and state entities have been exempt. We suggest that this established task force and its recommendations apply to state agencies, too.</p>	<p>Implementing this would ensure that the State is not exempted from the standards that private industry are held to in improving gender equity.</p>
<p>77)Create metrics for benchmarking progress to achieving equity for gender, racial, sexual orientation, and other diverse identities. Determine if we have current data as a baseline, and if there's authority to collect such metrics.</p>	
<p>78)Examine existing fair hiring and anti-discrimination policies, like CalEPA's for example</p>	

79) Provide clear instructions on how to apply for state jobs, links to tutorial videos at the header of every job posting. Train HR personal who are listed as a contact person on job postings to assist people through the application process.	Overall application process is not intuitive and prohibitive to people who don't have an "insider" helping them; typically, people from backgrounds that would promote diversity and inclusion do not tend to have "insiders" in their network.
80) Recruit in diverse communities, participate in existing career fairs and community events/fairs rather than hosting separate events at state offices during regular work hours (go to them).	We should think from the user perspective, not what is most convenient for the agency.
81) Consult with existing organizations that are assisting people on how to get a state job about ways to simplify the application process (like NxtGov, for example)	People are currently seeking assistance from third parties.
82) Use techniques to reduce bias in the hiring process, including removing names and other identifying information from applications, exams, and aptitude tests, conducting initial interviews over the phone, and improving transparency of criteria that agencies use to assess minimum qualifications	
83) Add criteria to hiring exams that allow for the demonstration of value from diverse perspectives, such that candidates' different lived experiences are accounted for in rankings.	
84) Streamline the process for creating internships.	Internships can be immensely influential in expanding opportunities, especially when paid a fair rate.
85) Streamline procurement process for language access services and related resources to state entities attempting to reduce language barriers, including efforts to use and promote "plain language". This begins with exploring and building a common, verified dataset for language access barriers in all of CA. Value, curate and share open data datasets across state entities that will inform language barriers with all interested parties and stakeholders.	
86) Improve the Examination and Certification Online System (ECOS) platform to encourage recruitment efforts to conduct pilot	

projects to facilitate (maybe pilot) redaction/screening of names, education providers, etc.	
87) Reduce barriers to apply for state jobs where possible, specifically improve how jobs are made discoverable, the application form and classification limitations.	
88) Improve the State Controller's Office and CalHR datasets (5102 reports, etc.) to allow deeper and more specific analysis of race, ethnicity, and gender and related workforce events, such as intakes and promotions. Make the data machine readable and prioritize this data production annually.	
89) Conduct an assessment of the degree to which Prop 209 has dampened efforts to increase diversity among candidate pools and other ways in which Prop 209 may be misunderstood / misinterpreted by state agencies seeking to reduce legal risk.	
90) Revise existing workforce employee perspective survey instruments to include dimensions related to equity, diversity and inclusion—dimensions that were remarkably absent from the recent CalEPA employee perspective survey.	
91) Integrate an expanded conceptual framework of diversity and inclusion to include equity—what these concepts mean in practice and how they interrelate and build on one another. Engage CalHR's training design team to participate in Advancing Racial Equity in Government so that the team can then integrate the concepts throughout the suite of current training offerings and develop new ones.	
92) For example, Introduction to Implicit Bias should be taught in the context of privilege, racial equity and systemic and structural racism. Currently, it does not reach these concepts. b. Similarly, update the curriculum for Diversity and Inclusion to include these concepts. c. Update the implicit bias module of the 40-hour Introduction to Supervision course.	

93)Standardize the racial equity, implicit bias and related diversity core curricula across all products and departments to ensure common messaging and outcomes.	
94)Expand capacity to offer more opportunities for statewide racial equity cohort / collaborative involvement. Specifically, building a space statewide for more than the "Advanced Racial Equity" team seats (currently only 14 seats for ~6,000 employees at CalEPA) for employees with time, skills and interest but are maybe not lined up to be an "advanced class" member.	
95)Offer/mandate trainings related to diversity, equity, and inclusion (DEI) for staff and managers Implicit/unconscious bias Diversity training Cultural intelligence Emotional intelligence	The trainings will allow employees to become aware and informed about critical topics related to DEI.
96)Provide departments with better demographic and location data for applicants.	This information will help departments conduct more focused recruitment efforts.
97)Standardize/deliver an employee survey.	The survey will provide data regarding employees' perceptions of departments' diversity efforts.
98)Standardize definition of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and other related terms.	Most frequently used words in discussions on diversity can easily cause confusion. It is important to have a shared understanding of common terms to enhance discussions relating to Diversity, Equity, Inclusion.
99)Racial Equity Training Program, including one day (or half day) of racial equity 101 training, one day of implicit bias, one day of diversity and inclusion training, and one day of creating data collection, spotting disparities, and crafting policies that create equitable outcomes. This is relevant to all of the taskforces, especially D&I and Racial & Gender Pay Equity.	For people to understand their role in creating equitable outcomes, they need to first understand what equity is and what it would mean to achieve it. They also need to be given the tools and resources to achieve those goals. These trainings should also be required across the board for all employees, as equity should be an effort every person is involved in.
100) Require departments to include a diversity, equity, and inclusion statement on their website with associated action steps.	SGC has a racial equity statement and action plan that it has posted on its website. We are proud to be the first agency/department to

	have gone public with our racial equity action plan. We believe a strong commitment demonstrates leadership and a clear vision.
101) If a department has a public forum or hosts public meeting, ensure that diversity, equity, and inclusion is included as a standing item on the agenda.	At SGC, we report on our racial equity action plan annually to our council during our public meetings. We believe this helps with accountability and transparency.
102) Develop opportunities for Executive level engagement on issues of diversity, equity, and inclusion. Report to Cabinet Secretaries on a quarterly basis.	At SGC, our council is made up of Agency Secretaries and members of the public. We brief them on our diversity, equity, and inclusion efforts and take the opportunity to facilitate a discussion on the dais about racial equity. We believe this helps with executive level buy in.
103) Develop communications channels to elevate best practices across government. We recommend a quarterly newsletter that highlight how different agencies are advancing diversity, equity, and inclusion sent to HR, EEO, and Executive staff.	At SGC through HiAP, we elevate the work of our Capital Collaborative on Race and Equity participants through our newsletters and by convening executive briefing and organizing panel discussions. This is important to build the momentum across state government for this work and to share best practices with one other.
104) Establish an awards program that recognizes leaders who are taking bold actions to advance diversity, equity, and inclusion.	This is to elevate examples and to normalize racial equity work across an agency. For SGC, we recognize people's achievements at our Council meeting once a year.
105) Build and maintain a culture of competence on issues of diversity, equity, and inclusion.	At SGC, we offer funding for staff to get trained on issues of diversity, equity, and inclusion, as well as explicit and implicit bias. Staff-level competency on these issues is critical to ensure equitable outcomes.

<p>106) Establish equity officers/offices in major departments or agencies to support diversity, equity, and inclusion across workforce and programs.</p>	<p>SGC has identified a staff member who is responsible for implementing our racial equity action plan. The responsibilities are included in the staff members job duty statement. It is important to have staff that is dedicated to diversity, equity, and inclusion in order to ensure there is progress and a control point of accountability.</p>
<p>107) Develop a speaker series of racial equity and build a committed network of racial equity professionals.</p>	<p>SGC's HiAP staff has built a network of racial justice practitioners who have themselves built a network of practitioners who learn from one another and create opportunities for each other.</p>
<p>108) Develop and include equity and inclusion language on job postings and job duty statements</p>	<p>CalHR currently has equity, diversity, and inclusion language that can be used universally across all job postings. A consistent approach and message across all postings will create much needed uniformity.</p>
<p>109) Ask departments to fund advertisement to diverse networks and allow non-HR staff to do outreach and engagement in order to recruit diverse candidates</p>	<p>Recruitment and outreach is critical and there is limited staff at CalHR to conduct it for all departments. Leveraging existing staff and paid networks can help fill important gaps in reaching diverse candidates.</p>
<p>110) Require leadership and hiring managers to be trained on issues of implicit bias.</p>	<p>SGC/OPR presented on implicit bias to all Staff and reviews the materials before each hiring panel. Controlled scientific studies indicate that interview panelists' impressions of a candidate can be heavily influenced by the candidate's race, gender, ethnicity, and other characteristics. Bringing this unconscious bias more into the realm of consciousness is one way to decrease this effect. This can be done through implicit bias trainings, which are</p>

	common and at a minimum can be as short as a few hours in length.
111) Require that all application review processes anonymize applications during the first round of application review. See attached procedure outline from OPR/SGC which has been utilized for over a year.	Numerous controlled scientific studies show that implicit bias plays a strong role in how applications are perceived relative to a candidate's relative qualifications. A person's name, gender, or even mailing address can influence a reviewer's perception.
112) Require racial and gender diversity for all interview panels.	SGC requires race and gender diversity on every hiring panel. This is important because reviewers with different lived experiences and perspectives and can have useful evaluations of a candidate and their fit in the organization.
113) Require that departments include a diversity, equity, and inclusion question in their interview process (include different options as examples)	SGC asks a diversity, equity, and inclusion question in all our hires. Having this indicates to the hiring panel and the candidates that this is a core value of the organization.
114) CalHR can formalize relationships with local universities to provide offer internship opportunities.	Relationships with local universities and colleges can be held facilitated by CalHR.
115) Expand options for all State employees to access remote work and flexible schedule options. This facilitates healthier families and facilitates participation in the workforce by those who are caring for young children, elders, or both (which tend to be women). Many federal agencies (e.g. US EPA) have fairly advanced flex work and telework policies for all employees.	If we need proof that this expands opportunities for more women to participate in the workforce, see research literature.
116) GovOps and BCSH partner to establish an Employer-Assisted Housing program for low/moderate-income State workers.	EAH programs have been around for decades in the US, though they are more widespread in eastern states. Typically, an "anchor institution" such as government, health care, education, etc. creates a program to pay for some or all of an employee's down payment or security deposit for HOUSING THAT IS IN CLOSE PROXIMITY TO THE WORKPLACE. Sometimes it



	also involves an ongoing monthly housing subsidy for a set period of years. Typically, the recipient must stay both employed and housed for a minimum period, e.g. 5 years. This fosters: 1) improved attraction and retention of workforce for employers; 2) improved morale due to reduced commute burdens and housing cost burdens for employees; 3) greater accessibility of employment opportunities for lower-income workers who often have to travel extreme distances to access employment opportunities; 4) reduced environmental burden due to reduced commute distance; and 5) strengthens neighborhoods and communities in close proximity to employment centers, and can be targeted to benefit neighborhoods most in need of revitalization.
--	--

### III. Recommendations for Racial & Gender Pay Equity Task Force

Recommendations:	Notes:
117) GO (EDD). Expand parental leave policies for the public and private sector to be a more simple system that replaces as close to full income as possible for one year, regardless of the parent's gender or whether the need is related to a birth, adoption, or general care. Consider implementing paid leave for non-parents and family caregivers, to equalize leave among groups, including for people who choose not to have children.	Can improve gender equity and reduce discrimination to help support both parents having the opportunity to take leave to care for a child, supporting successful child development. Provides opportunities for professional and personal development that lead to a more productive, happier workforce across all groups.
118) CalHR/SPB. Resources for all state agencies to educate employees on how to obtain promotions and otherwise understand how to advance their careers. Clear requirements	Can improve gender equity and reduce discrimination to help all employees understand the promotion and recruitment

that management must follow that removes possibility for implicit bias from hiring and promotional decisions, including requirements for offering clear, candid feedback to employees, "blind" hiring and promotion practices, and requirements for peer review to be part of the review of an employee. Review of agencies with a majority of certain genders and races in management, to understand the reasons behind this and how diversity can be increased.	system to seek advancement in their careers. Reviews help to pinpoint the reasons behind existing inequities, to create more effective future policies.
119) CalHR/SPB. Recommend redacting state applications to remove indicators of race and gender to improve equity in hiring and promotion	Evidence shows removing identifying features from resumes addresses, in part, biases in hiring.
120) EEO: CARB HR needs to provide a strategic plan on how to evaluate and implement Racial & Gender Pay Equity although this only applies to CEA positions.	Most of the employees are in a pay range dictated by the Civil Service classification and pay. This Racial & Gender Pay Equity applies to CEA positions when they have a pay range that each person appointed to the position gets based on several criteria. Study shows disparity in pay with the same responsibilities when the person appointed is a woman or a person from a different race.
121) Ensure that the groups staffing this task force are diverse with respect to gender, race, age, sexual orientation, etc.	Studies show that businesses with more diverse board members are more successful; decision makers should include people who can bring diverse perspectives to the table.
122) Ensure that hiring panels are diverse, both for hiring and promotions, and include staff peers and not just supervisors.	Data shows that people are more likely to choose those who look like them. Adding diversity to hiring panels can increase diversity of hires and promotions.
123) Allow agencies flexibility in the use of different classifications to better fit the work needed.	For example, there are many tasks within CARB's work that do not require a degree in science or engineering, yet staff are hesitant to re-classify positions for fear of "losing an APS", even though the work could be done by

	other classifications with different experience and backgrounds.
124) Allow hiring of managers from outside the agency.	There are very few opportunities currently for CARB to hire people for management positions who don't already work for CARB, which narrows opportunities for people with different experiences and perspectives.
125) Create transparency around hiring and promotion process by sharing candidate scoring , perhaps by request, encouraging managers to be open and provide feedback on decision reasoning to top applicants who did not get the job, and creating guidelines for agency audits of hiring processes for equity.	People don't currently have a way of understanding why some candidates were chosen above others, especially when it seems that males with less experience are chosen for promotions over females that seem better equipped.
126) Coach staff on how to be promoted and implement trainings, utilize career centers within agencies, and implement mentorship programs to help people understand the process.	
127) Conduct a study, tracking diversity throughout the hiring and promotion process, to determine at what point do we see people dropping out of the application process; analyze causes and barrier points for these groups to apply.	
128) Require departments to track and report organization-wide demographics and publish findings on a centralized website.	Data is published in a recent publication on the pay gap "Racial and Gender Pay Gaps in California state Government A Path Towards Workforce Equity." CalHR provided this data. These types of reports and opportunities to do data visualization help identify the critical issues we are confronting and where we should invest our resources.

#### IV. Recommendations for Sexual Harassment and Discrimination Prevention and Response Task Force

Recommendations:	Notes:
------------------	--------

<p>129) DOF. Task force to review the State's fiscal policies and laws (such as the budget, tax statutes,) to identify and remove or modify those that result in discriminatory effects between different gender, racial, ethnic, sexual orientation, and other groups. Task force should result in concrete policies to be implemented by State agencies, with clear goals and steps to achieve each goal, not just guidance. Task force work product should be based on outreach and public meetings to engage diverse groups of people, including those not regularly consulted.</p>	<p>Most laws are no longer drafted with the purpose to discriminate; however, many fiscal and other State policies continue to have discriminatory effects. This task force would look at how the State taxes and spends public funds to root out any that are unintentionally perpetuating or creating discriminatory outcomes. Public input into State policies reduces the likelihood of discriminatory effects and creates public faith and trust in government and law.</p>
<p>130) GO (Dept. Ed.). Task force to recommend improvements to K-12, community college, and public university education to reduce sexual harassment and discrimination based on gender, race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, etc. (e.g., consent, healthy relationships, respect, implicit bias).</p>	<p>Much of the sexual harassment and discrimination faced today is because of a system that supported or did not do enough to prevent certain views and behaviors, or offer education to understand one's own implicit bias, in years past. By educating children, and continuing to educate them into adulthood, on concepts that are important to prevent sexual harassment and discrimination, we can strive to minimize negative outcomes in future decades.</p>
<p>131) All Agencies. Collect data that studies all genders, races, ethnicities, sexual orientations, disabilities etc., to the extent feasible with available participants, to ensure that data relied on by State agencies represents good understanding of impact across all stakeholders. (Note, disability is not referenced in the task forces, though it is an important element of anti-discrimination and diversity work)</p>	<p>Ensures that State practices address the need of all peoples who could be affected, and increases likelihood of public buy-in, making regulation more effective at reaching mandates and reducing public health and other impacts.</p>
<p>132) EEO: Develop and Implement stringent policies, procedures and a process for training for the employees who are non-compliant with the mandatory training Sexual Harassment &amp; Discrimination Training.</p>	<p>Employees are not taking this training seriously and not considered as priority.</p>

133) EEO: Develop and Implement stringent policies, procedures and a process for training to all MANAGERS AND SUPERVISORS whose employees are non-compliant with the mandatory training Sexual Harassment & Discrimination Training.	Managers & Supervisors are held in a higher standard and not taking responsibility for their non-compliant employees.
134) EEO: Include mandatory training such as Sexual Harassment and Discrimination Prevention as part of the annual performance report.	Part of employee expectations and performance is to attend mandatory training.
135) EEO: Fully staff and support the EEO office to implement, manage, enforce, and administer the programs.	One person could not do the job to fully execute the program. Other tasks like updating or creating new policies, designing or executing training takes a back seat when there are pending investigations.
136) Enhance existing trainings with opportunities for participants to practice what they learn in work-related ways/projects, and design follow up to trainings.	
137) Conduct a public engagement process on proposed State measures to improve diversity and solicit feedback from individuals who have not succeeded in state jobs, or in getting a job, and service organizations that help to employ people.	
138) Provide guidance and encourage Departments to develop or expand a centralized interpreter/translator list(s) of bilingual personnel. Guidance should emphasize the lists to match the needs of the population served by the Department. Guidance should encourage Departments to compensate bilingual personnel, in accordance with bargaining contracts.	
139) Guidance and protocol for translations should include: 1. There should be a focus on developing culturally appropriate material for target populations instead of just translating material developed for mainstream audiences 2. Translation should be done by one person and reviewed by one or two other individuals. 3. Translations should be done jointly with local community we serve to ensure cultural and linguistic appropriateness. 4. Departments/programs should develop a list	

of commonly used terms that are translated into the language of their target populations. The development of this list(s) should include community and stakeholder feedback to ensure relevance of the commonly used terms.	
140) Departments should evaluate their language access practices and determine if there is a need for a department specific language access policy. If so, this language access policy should be in compliance with the Dymally-Alatorre Bilingual Services Act, see example of a language access policy: <a href="https://dtsc.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/31/2018/07/DTSC-Language-Access-Policy.pdf">https://dtsc.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/31/2018/07/DTSC-Language-Access-Policy.pdf</a> .	

## V. Recommendations for Public Safety Diversity Task Force

Recommendations:	Notes:
141) Don't do implicit bias trainings alone – ensure that these are packaged with other strategies to ensure systems change.	Significant evidence points to implicit bias trainings having limited to no impact when conducted on their own with a tie to larger institutional change goals and strategies.
142) Examine workforce hiring, promotion, and other process using an equity analysis tool to understand how racial, gender, and other biases may play out not only through individual behaviors but also through the ways that institutions operate and practices are implemented.	
143) GO should provide direction to all agencies to improve racial, gender, sexual orientation, etc. equity and increase gender, racial, ethnic, etc. diversity within organizations. Direction and budget resources for all agencies to implement best practices and guidance to achieve gender, racial, ethnic, etc. equity. Direction and budget resources to increase outreach and inclusion of different races, genders, ethnicities, sexual orientations, etc. in outreach and rulemakings, and to seek regular public input on, and do regular review of,	Need to ensure support for changing systems that perpetuate inequities within agencies and in their work with the public. Public input by all groups into State policies reduces the likelihood of discriminatory effects and creates public faith and trust in government and law, making it more effective and reducing violations.

effectiveness and impact of programs across different races, genders, ethnicities, sexual orientations, etc.	
144) For any study or research sponsored by the state, collect data in a way that allows for disaggregation by gender, race, ability, age, and other classes, and take care to get sufficient data for those groups.	This is important because State actions to remediate inequalities based on protected classes need to have evidence that a problem exists under California law. If we do not begin to collect disaggregated data, we will not be able to demonstrate documentation for the problems that we all witness daily but can only discuss on an anecdotal level. An example of gathering disaggregated data is the LA Metro Study on women's use of transit, which documents how the transit system fails to provide equal access and safety to women, transgender, and girls because of assumptions made about ridership based on a typical full-time male worker's transit needs. The 2019 book, "Invisible Women: Exposing Data Bias in a World designed for Men" by Caroline Criado Perez documents how data that is not disaggregated by gender is usually based on male experiences and often leads to inequitable and often harmful policies in medicine, transit and development planning, personal protective equipment, disaster relief, automobile safety design, etc.
145) Offer/mandate trainings related to diversity, equity and inclusion (DEI) for staff and managers Implicit/unconscious bias Diversity training Cultural intelligence Emotional intelligence.	The trainings will allow employees to become aware and informed about critical topics related to DEI
146) Provide departments with better demographic and location data for applicants.	This information will help departments conduct more focused recruitment efforts

147) Standardize/deliver an employee survey to understand employees' perception of the department's diversity efforts, and their experiences as employees.	This data will be useful in identifying areas for further work.
148) Standardize definition of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and other related terms.	Most frequently used words in discussions on diversity can easily cause confusion. It is important to have a shared understanding of common terms to enhance discussions relating to Diversity, Equity, Inclusion
149) Provide incentives for geographic areas (or units) that eliminate racial disparities in the traffic stops made.	
150) Require mandatory "community policing" for every uniform officer - at least 2 days per month. Could be community hosted events, or attendance at community events.	
151) Implicit bias testing in the initial phase of hiring, followed by implicit bias training and testing every two years.	
152) Mandatory therapy and mental health service for trauma and bias in uniform employees.	

## VI. Recommendations from 2018 HiAP Task Force Workforce Equity Report

The following recommendations are pulled from the 2018 HiAP Task Force report "Racial and Gender Pay Gaps in California State government: A Path Towards Workforce Equity", which can be accessed at:

<https://sgc.ca.gov/programs/hiap/docs/20180719->

[Racial and Gender Pay Gaps in California State Government A Path Towards Workforce Equity.pdf](#). The full report includes detailed rationale and descriptions for each of the following recommendations.

Category A: Recommendations for CCORE (formerly the GARE Capitol Cohort) and its participating member departments
153) Analyze race and gender pay equity for each participating GARE Capitol Cohort department using disaggregated data.
154) Incorporate CalHR workforce development and planning information into the GARE Capitol Cohort training curriculum.
155) Integrate racial and gender pay equity analysis into departmental GARE Racial Equity Action Plans.



Category B: Recommendations to increase applicability, transparency, and accessibility of State data
156) Update Questionnaire 1070 to include more racial and gender options.
157) Track and document self-reported data from Questionnaire 1070.
158) Enhance accessibility of publicly available data.
Category C: Enhance and expand workforce development strategies to increase pay parity for the larger enterprise of State government
159) Learn from existing state and local racial equity initiatives.
160) Bolster racial equity components of existing Upward Mobility, Workforce Development and Planning, and Civil Rights programs at the California Department of Human Resources.
161) Conduct further research to refine the State's understanding of the racial/gender pay gap and its underlying drivers.